# AUTHOR'S QUERY SHEET

Author(s): Reviews REMF 227218
Article title:
Article no:

Dear Author

Some questions have arisen during the preparation of your manuscript for typesetting. Please consider each of the following points below and make any corrections required in the proofs.

Please do not give answers to the questions on *this* sheet. All corrections should be made directly in the printed proofs.

AQ1 "the public vetting of grievances" – do you mean *vetting* or should it perhaps be *venting*?

*Ethnomusicology Forum*
*Vol. 16, No. 1, June 2007, pp. 157–181*

Routledge
Taylor & Francis Group

# Reviews

**Journey of Song: Public Life and Morality in Cameroon**
CLARE A. IGNATOWSKI
Bloomington, IN, Indiana University Press, 2006
xi + 220 pp., ISBN: 0-253-21794-6 ($24.95)

*Journey of Song* is an ethnography of *gurna*, an important dance society that performs at public death celebrations among the Tupuri people of northern Cameroon. Like other recent studies of dynamic African music traditions, such as Daniel Reed's (2003) investigation of transformations within Dan masking associations in Côte d'Ivoire, Ignatowski aims to show how *gurna* continues to prove relevant in different ways to contemporary Tupuri living in rural villages, regional towns and the Cameroonian capital Yaoundé. The Tupuri, like many African ethnic groups, are currently in the midst of an important cultural revolution, whereby traditional praxes, including marriage, religion, and music, are competing with Christianity, Western education and the nation-state to articulate the *zeitgeist* for the modern era. Traditions like *gurna* are threatened by Christianity, which views it as a remnant of paganism, and by Western education, which devalues it as an unproductive activity devoid of any economic potential. This book seeks to understand how the present generation of Tupuri, whose ethos represents a creolization of Western and traditional sources, engage with the *gurna* dance, and by extension traditional culture.

*Journey of Song* contains two major parts: an anthropological account of the current state of the *gurna* tradition (introduction, chapters 3 to 5) and a critical analysis of *gurna* songs as a body of oral literature (chapters 6 to 9). *Gurna* societies are voluntary organizations that set up camps at the periphery of village settlements during the non-agricultural season from November until July. Primarily a male society, membership is open to men above the age of 16, who must contribute a cow in order to gain admission. These cows contribute milk for nourishment, in a process of ritual fattening whereby adepts prepare their bodies for the public dances. Girls may also participate from the time they are 13 years old until they marry, when they normally are permitted a final season in the *gurna* of their husband's village in order to become integrated into their new locales. In Tupuri villages *gurna* provide socialization and courtship functions, as well as maintaining the larger cultural world

ISSN 1741-1912 (print)/ISSN 1741-1920 (online)/07/010157-25

DOI: 10.1080/17411910701273101

of the group by passing down important oral histories, myths and knowledge of the occult.

Apart from rural villages, the author aims to investigate the retention and refashioning of *gurna* societies among a group of *lycée* (high school) students who have formed an after-school club that seeks to provide a forum for Tupuri students to express group solidarity as well as to critique school authorities and policies. Additionally, the book touches on a group of Tupuri living in Yaoundé who have formed a cultural club that seeks to present Tupuri culture on the national stage as a piece of folklore. While this attempt at an extended portrait of *gurna* is laudable, the author does not devote adequate attention to the school and city contexts. In order fully to understand the transformations of *gurna* within these new environments, the author would need to present more information concerning the socio-cultural context of Tupuri living in these locations. Either the book should have been longer, and these aspects developed more fully, or they should have been reserved for subsequent publications. This portion of the material would have also benefited from the inclusion of more transcribed interviews from the *gurna* participants, in order to create a more multi-vocal text in the vein of Chernoff's (1979) discussion of music, meaning and value with Dagomba drummer Ibrahim Abdulai. If the author's goal is to represent the individual mediation of meaning and value towards the *gurna* tradition it is important that we hear more of these personal views in the finished text.

The second half of the book examines the songs of *gurna* as oral literature. Studies on African oral literature, especially the works by Ruth Finnegan (1970) and Isidore Okpewho (1992), have argued that song texts provide an important record of the creative process, as well as providing a window into socio-cultural life in African societies. Building on these studies, Ignatowski divides the songs into four thematic categories: praise and greeting, meta-commentary on the dance, insults and social critique. Unlike other genres of African praise poetry, *gurna* does not seem to maintain hierarchical patron–client relationships, but rather serves to acknowledge friends and supporters of the composer, a practice the author adeptly compares to 'shout-outs' used by hip-hop artists in the United States. *Gurna* texts also comment on the dance, and try to stimulate both dancers and audience members to enliven the moment. Insults play an important role in *gurna*, and are given special treatment in chapter 8. Not only do insults provide a creative stimulus to composers, who try and outdo each other, but they also allow the public vetting of grievances in order to promote social healing. Finally, songs encode moral precepts by lambasting people who transgress social mores as well as criticizing people who abuse authority. This portion of the study is excellently researched and presented, and will prove useful material for future studies of African oral literature.

As the focus of *Journey of Song* is primarily a cultural study of *gurna* there are no musical discussions, transcriptions or audio examples. However, Ignatowski succeeds wonderfully in presenting the ethnopoetics of *gurna* as well as in portraying the dynamic nature of the tradition. She also discusses the compositional process as well as looking at the dissemination of new compositions. This book will be an important

contribution to the study of African arts and literature, and provides a rich account of a contemporary African culture.

## References

Chernoff, John M. 1979. *African rhythm and African sensibility: Aesthetics and social action in African musical idioms*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.

Finnegan, Ruth. 1970. *Oral literature in Africa*. London: Oxford University Press.

Okpewho, Isidore. 1992. *African oral literature: Backgrounds, character, and continuity*. Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press.

Reed, Daniel B. 2003. *Dan ge performance: Masks and music in contemporary Côte d'Ivoire*. Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press.

James Burns
*Music Department, Binghamton University*
*jburns@binghamton.edu*

## Popular Music Censorship in Africa

Michael Drewett and Martin Cloonan (eds)
Aldershot, Ashgate, 2006
xii + 228 pp., ISBN: 0-7546-5291-2 (£55.00)

This is a book on a very important and serious topic which highlights the intricate relation between music and social action. It addresses the freedom of expression in music and, whether or not you agree with the stance of the book, it is hard to stay unaffected by the very conspicuous role of music in times of politics and war, ethnic and racial struggle, and postcolonial repercussion. By documenting various cases in which popular musics in Africa have either been or not been censored, the book argues that music is not a neutral agent, but rather a contested space. The activist point of departure is seen in the dedication of the volume to the work of the international organization Freemuse, which advocates freedom of expression for musicians and composers worldwide.

The book is in two main parts: "Censorship issues" and "Case studies". In the introduction Martin Cloonan identifies five main areas of censorship in Africa: colonial and postcolonial history, the importance of local traditions of regulating culture, the encounter with Western 'norms' and the dominance of broadcasting. He interprets censorship as an integral part of an ongoing cultural struggle.

The case of South Africa dominates the volume. In the first of three articles Michael Drewett reflects on how the cultural boycott of the 1980s affected musical life in South Africa and questions whether the boycott was an issue of censorship. It follows that there was some censorship occurring, and that this thoroughly affected the development of local music. Drewett concludes that choices on how to deal with a political situation must always be with the musicians themselves, a perspective which is continued in many of the following chapters.

Describing Tutsi and Hutu conflicts during the 1994 Rwanda civil war Dylan Craig and Nomalanga Mkhise discuss issues of causality in the relationship between a single song and its effect on the escalating crisis and ask if it should have been banned. Similarly Gary Baines addresses racist hate speech in 21st-century South Africa and calls for an evaluation of the effect and justification of censorship. The general question of whether freedoms of expression should ever be restricted or renounced is in both cases, but with different scopes, dismissed and the authors conclude that, since events were rooted in historical and social causes, banning the music would only have been "to shoot the messenger" (p. 50). This discourse is fundamental to musicology and taken up throughout the present volume.

In an informative account of Zimbabwe based on ethnographic fieldwork, Diane Thram gives a thumb-nail sketch of the music scene of Harare, and introduces the perspective of musicians. In a repressive and media-controlling regime like that of Mugabe, the practical consequence of censorship for blacklisted musicians is "no musical life" due to lack of channels for making music.

Wilson Akpan, in his chapter on hip-hop in Nigeria, departs from the idea that censorship must be "systematic" and suggests instead that the social character of emancipatory message music should be considered. Arguing that art is "imbued with a particular ideology" (p. 92), he rejects its neutrality, but proposes an analytical distinction between censorship from within (state) and that from without (market and globalization). In conclusion, Akpan finds that suppression of message music in Nigeria has taken place through both conservative state censorship and the asymmetries of global cultural consumption, which bring tough-language hip-hop lyrics from the West.

Reuben M. Chirambo offers a view into a classical case of state surveillance and increasing paranoia in Malawi, which makes citizens spy anonymously for the regime. The resulting self-censorship introduces another important topic in the volume. The article discusses hegemony in the Gramscian sense while at the same time it also describes the very prominent role of music in public functions, thus giving a start to Johnny Clegg and Michael Drewett's examination of characteristics of South African censorship in relation to apartheid and race. Permissible activities did not include having black and white musicians in the same band, and Clegg's crossover band Juluka was banned and accused of bastardizing Western music by mixing it with African culture. Still, according to former police agent Paul Erasmus, Clegg – "*Est Zulu blanc*" (the white Zulu) – due to his high profile had more space than others. Taking the opportunity, he made performance a means of resistance, thus preparing the audiences "for a post-apartheid future" (p. 133), and underscoring the important ability of music cultures to counteract suppression.

A deeper plunge into history is taken by Kelly Askew and John Francis Kitime on Tanzania, by Peter Muhoro Mwangi on Kenya and by John Collins on Ghana. All present broad tales of instances of censorship through almost 100 years and, even if they are documented and well-informed, they risk generalizations due to the very short format. Combined, they illustrate how institutions of the colonial system are

inherited by post-independence rulers, often transforming music culture to become part of didactic forums serving state or socialist ends, policing morality and protecting the political order.

A different perspective is taken up by Graeme Ewens in a story on the grand master of Zaïrean popular music Franco Makiadi. Since he was the compatriot of Mobuto and a cultural agent for the campaign for authenticity, the story of the legend's imprisonment for obscene references to sex and drugs in the 1978 songs "Helene" and "Jacky" juxtaposes different roles and functions in relation to Mobuto's regime and its use of censorship.

The last entry, by Malika Mehdid on the very restricted situation of freedom of speech and culture in Algeria, discusses the overall theme of the book, and makes a distinction between two concepts: censure and censorship. Relating these to the contested and violent history of *raï*, the chapter appropriately reminds readers that censorship and freedom of expression are parts of an ongoing struggle, and not relegated to historical pasts.

In conclusion the editors draw up some general points, finding, first, that the preceding case studies prove that censorship is a characteristic of all societies (it has changing shapes but is ever present); second, that censorship in Africa is connected to resistance; and, third, that musicians are particularly targeted in this process but that they are also co-opted. Cloonan and Drewett sum up how what happened in colonial times had strong consequences for postcolonial Africa, as the structures of former masters were transformed into agencies upholding control for new nation-states and suppressing the peoples in regimes fearing democracy, freedom of expression and human rights. A question which permeates the book is whether censorship can in some instances be "politically correct" or even preferred. Cloonan and Drewett advocate that musicians be permitted to voice their opinions so that public debate is encouraged and issues openly dealt with rather than hidden from public view.

While the book does not as such contribute to ethnomusicology – for this, too many important texts dealing with issues of meaning and interpretation of race and postcolonial issues are missing – it offers important knowledge on African popular culture. As with anthologies generally this production is perhaps an uneven one, but the most fundamental problem is the separation of music and lyrics in many chapters, dividing music into two halves. Sound, lyrics and movement are in fact inseparable and, as many chapters neglect sound in preference of lyrics, the present volume pays too little attention to music. The strength of the book, however, is that it convincingly and with many fine case studies paves the way for more research on the important issue of music censorship. As such *Popular Music Censorship in Africa* will be of interest to both scholars and students.

Annemette Kirkegaard
*University of Copenhagen*
*kirkegd@hum.ku.dk*

**Vodou Nation: Haitian Art Music and Cultural Nationalism**
MICHAEL LARGEY
Chicago, IL, University of Chicago Press, 2006
283 pp., ISBN: 0-226-46863 (US$25.00/£16.00)

Michael Largey's *Vodou Nation: Haitian Art Music and Cultural Nationalism* (2006) is the first book-length ethnography devoted to the musical practices of Haiti's upper class. Largey defines the "Vodou nation" as "an elite vision of the Haitian nation that, in times of political strife, selectively associated Haitian elites with Haitian lower classes" (p. 4). Focused on the period between 1890 and 1950 (when Haiti celebrated the Haitian revolution's centennial, then endured the United States' military occupation), Largey examines how Haitian and African American composers (all trained in the European art music tradition) engaged with the music and lore of Vodou – Haiti's "African-derived . . . traditional religion" (p. 242) – in order to advance various nationalist agendas. This exploration of the creative tensions between Vodou and art music offers a richly nuanced view of elite Haitian society, including its cultural values, competing political ideologies and prejudices against Haiti's poor masses – whose "'African' tendencies" were often regarded as "regressive" (p. 35).

Although these same elites saw themselves as forward-looking contributors to French culture, and strategically distanced themselves from politically problematic African nations, Largey shows that Haitian art music has nevertheless been continuously informed by and evaluated in terms of Vodou. Largey qualifies this truth through an examination of the "complex interplay" between ethnography, musical composition and "cultural memory" (pp. 4, 19) – a term Largey adapts from Marita Sturken (1997, 3) – to refer to ways that composers imagined they were connected to Haitian history, whether to the Haitian revolution, to an African legacy or to French cultural heritage.

Largey's text represents an exhaustive archival research effort in addition to his own ethnographic research since the 1980s. Largey also uses compelling sources he calls "experiential programs", which are poems or narratives detailing the writer's subjective experience and interpretation of a composition. By combining historical and ethnographic music research methods, Largey presents an example of musicology at its best: the reader is guided toward a highly nuanced understanding of each composer and his music in relation to not only the composer's own vision of the "Vodou nation" but also the varied ways audiences ascribed meaning to the composer's music. Even as Largey connects his Haitian materials to a wide and diverse literature (e.g. ethnomusicological studies of cultural nationalism), his analyses always privilege Haitian perspectives, portrayed with admirable intellectual honesty.

*Vodou Nation* proceeds chronologically, with discussions of each successive composer organized around different modes of "cultural memory". For example, chapter 2 explores how Haitian composer Occide Jeanty's music and persona strongly

evoke nationalist sentiment as a result of "recombinant mythology" – a uniquely Haitian cultural process in which historical fact and national mythology become linked together. Chapter 3 demonstrates how Ludovich Lamothe transformed popular street *méringues* and Vodou music into salon music – a process known in Haiti as "vulgarization". Justin Elie sought to elevate Haitian art music through a process of "classicization" by linking his compositions to more prestigious historical antecedents like a pre-Columbian, Arawak heritage or the Egyptian civilization of North Africa. Chapter 4 describes "diasporic cosmopolitanism" as a process through which African-American composers and writers drew upon Haiti's revolutionary history, musical aesthetics and Vodou mythology to compose two operas: *Ouanga*, by Clarence Cameron White and librettist John Frederick Matheus, and *Troubled Island*, by William Grant Still and librettist Langston Hughes. Finally, chapter 5 describes how musical transcription became a calculated, political act when Werner Jaegerhuber's "music ideology" led him to choose a notation scheme for Haiti's characteristic *quintolet* – "five-note" – rhythm that Jaegerhuber believed would stress the *quintolet*'s African origin.

Since the Haitian elite had only limited personal experience with the culture of Haiti's socially distant (if "culturally intimate", p. 13) poor masses, Largey examines how so-called "ethnography" or "research" intersected with the project of musical nationalism. In chapter 1, Largey discusses how Jean Price-Mars – one of Haiti's most formidable intellectuals – championed using Haiti's African-derived music to promote his socially progressive vision of Haitian nationalism in which "elites would provide uplift to the poverty-stricken masses through educational reform" and the "masses, in turn, would provide . . . their African-derived folklore that distinguished Haitian culture" (p. 43). Largey's discussion of how Haitian art music composers measured up to this vision reveals a complex web of tensions – some social, others compositional. On the one hand, even as Lamothe and Jaegerhuber's writings demonstrate their commitment to using Vodou music as the basis for an original Haitian music (one which could achieve greatness within the Western European art music canon), Haitian composers found reception of their music both at home and abroad dependent upon their audiences' various pre-conceptions about Vodou (ranging from being a symbol of black resistance to the basest exoticism of a touristic sideshow). On the other hand, even though Vodou's image remained problematic, and the "ethnography" informing composers' Vodou-inspired compositions revealed more about elite "ethnographers" than about Vodou itself, "ethnographic verisimilitude" (p. 133) in Haitian cultural production proved remarkably marketable. (For example, favourable reviews of Elie's compositions in the United States reveal a preoccupation with Elie's ethnographic credentials – which were entirely fabricated.)

The epilogue summarizes *Vodou Nation*'s intersecting themes while demonstrating their continued relevance for Haiti at the end of the 20th century. Through descriptions of his own ethnographic experiences, Largey shows that upper-class musicians still undertake "research" in order to borrow Vodou music and lore for

their own socio-political goals; that traditional culture remains a focus of attempts to redeem the Haitian nation by forging connections between elites and lower classes; that Haitian artists still strive to create music that is both "culturally unique and musically universal" (p. 5); that Western notation of Haiti's traditional rhythms remains problematic; and that the "participatory" performance values of Haiti's traditional music persist even in "presentational," art music concerts (p. 222).

*Vodou Nation* will be profitably included on course syllabuses in ethnomusicology, historical musicology, Caribbean studies and African diaspora cultural theory. Particularly notable is Largey's contribution to African diaspora studies by charting a "long history of transnational contact" (p. 6) between elite Haitians and African Americans – what Paul Gilroy refers to as African "routes" (1993, 148). Furthermore, Largey critically engages less-examined features of the African diaspora, such as internal class and gender conflicts, upper class ambivalence toward lower-class culture and national, religious and cultural differentiation between black communities in Haiti and the United States.

Musicologists will find judiciously selected excerpts of musical scores supporting the author's music analyses (erroneous double bars and a misspelled chord are minor distractions). The excerpts are invitingly easy to read, but playing through these examples highlighted for me how much more Largey might have said about the *quintolet* rhythm – particularly about how it sounds. Considering allusions to the *quintolet*'s African or Vodou derivation, Largey's arguments could have been furthered by describing how *quintolet* might be rhythmically coordinated (useful to non-Haitians grappling with the *quintolet*'s widely divergent representations) and how *quintolet*'s performance practice has varied across genres, between performers and through time.

Though Largey leaves his reader hungry to hear and know more, what Largey has offered is a revelatory documentation of the "Vodou Nation" that stands out as one of the finest contributions yet made to Haitian music history.

## References

Gilroy, Paul. 1993. *The Black Atlantic: Modernity and double consciousness*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Sturken, Marita. 1997. *Tangled memories: The Vietnam War, the AIDS epidemic, and the politics of remembering*. Berkeley and Los Angeles, CA: University of California Press.

Rebecca Sager
*Independent Scholar, Tallahassee*
*rsager@music.org*

**Choro: A Social History of a Brazilian Popular Music**

Tamara Elena Livingston-Isenhour and Thomas George Caracas Garcia
Bloomington, IN, Indiana University Press, 2005
xiii + 254 pp. (with CD), ISBN: 0-253-34541-3 (cloth US$55.00); 0-253-21752-0 (pbk US$24.95)

A book in English on the Brazilian *choro* has been long overdue, and, for this reason alone, this publication is most welcome. The *choro* is an instrumental tradition originally based around a flute, a guitar and a *cavaquinho* (small four-stringed instrument similar to a ukulele), that emerged in Rio de Janeiro in the second half of the 19th century among street musicians who "Brazilianized" such European dances as the polka and the waltz, while also drawing on the *modinha* and the *lundu*, styles that had already become consolidated in Brazil. *Choro* remained popular well into the 1940s, but then lost visibility, only to be revived in the 1970s, remaining popular to the present day. The book, *Choro: A Social History of a Brazilian Popular Music*, is the outcome of research conducted by two scholars, Tamara Elena Livingston-Isenhour and Thomas George Caracas Garcia, who completed doctoral dissertations on the *choro* at about the same time. Rather than publish two books on the same topic simultaneously, they decided to join forces and produce a single volume together. The outcome is a competent account of the emergence and development of *choro* from its 19th-century roots to the present, looking at how both wider social circumstances and notable individuals collectively forged the genre.

The book begins with a very useful analysis of *choro* as a musical genre, outlining the role of each of the key instruments in the ensemble along with musical transcriptions exemplifying playing techniques and stylistic features. These fundamental features followed the genre throughout its various phases. The musicologically oriented reader will also be drawn to the book's final chapter, which addresses the use of *choro* in Brazilian art music, most notably in the work of Heitor Villa-Lobos, but also of Camargo Guarnieri, Radamés Gnattali, Guerra-Peixe and others. As a musical genre, *choro* performance requires a fair level of musical aptitude, challenging musicians to display their skills and virtuosity. Thus, an important aspect of *choro* is "*malícia*" (malice), defined as an 'attitude of spirited competition in which one musician strive to outwit the other' (p. 10); *malícia* is critical for demarcating the ethos of the genre, in which the technical demands of the genre are continuously tested, as are the musicians' abilities to improvise.

The authors outline three major phases for the *choro*: an early phase in which the basic features of the genre were established, a mature phase in which the style became associated with larger ensembles known as *regionais* and its revival phase which, it could be argued, is still under way. The authors show how in each of these phases the genre articulated the dominant discourses in the country pertaining to race and

national identity, issues that have been central to all forms of Brazilian popular music since the late 18th century.

In many ways the *choro* is implicated in the same dynamics of racism and the transformation of racial discourses into the basis of national identity that have been well documented for other Brazilian musical style, particularly the samba. However, one must ask, what differences might there have been between samba and *choro*? If there really are none, what contribution can a social history of *choro* make? There are, in fact, hints of differences in the book, although they have not, I believe, received the full attention of the authors. *Choro*, unlike samba, was closely linked to an urban mulatto class of petty civil servants and small businessmen, such as tailors, barbers, grocers and the like, which provided a buffer that gave the genre, at least initially, some protection against associations that would link it to fundamentally African origins. Indeed, *choro* contributed significantly towards the emergence of *samba-canção*, the respectable form of samba popularized by the radio. It would appear, therefore, that a closer investigation of the development of *choro* might highlight nuances that will lead to revisions in the standard narrative on music, race and national identity in Brazil.

Without doubt, the most captivating sections of the book are those linked to the authors' direct field experiences in the world of *choro*. Chapter 3, "The *Roda de Choro*: heart and soul of *choro*", takes the reader into the social atmosphere of the genre, where sociality and musicianship coalesce, a world in which friends get together to play music for the sheer enjoyment they get from group performance. The success of the *roda* (circle) depends upon the parity of musical skills of the participants as well as their adherence to the unwritten rules negotiated within the group, a situation that could be usefully viewed in relation to other settings of social music making, such as jazz or the Irish music session.

Similarly, the final chapters dedicated to the revival of *choro* from the 1970s onwards also cover new ground by viewing the movement in relation to a model of music revivalism. What is a bit disappointing here is that the model is presented as a given rather than as the outcome of a systematic analysis of the dynamics of the revival process within *choro*. Given that previous sections of the book strove to link socio-historical circumstance to individual contribution within the contexts of musical negotiations, the discussion of how these processes articulated to the phases in the revival model would undoubtedly have moved the book as a whole into an entirely different category.

Nonetheless, the book is very useful and carefully researched. It is my hope that it will stimulate further interest in the *choro* as a genre as well as in the investigation into the socio-historical dynamics of musical performance in general.

Suzel Reily
*Queen's University, Belfast*
*s.reily@qub.ac.uk*

**P'ungmul: South Korean Drumming and Dance**

NATHAN HESSELINK

Chicago, IL, and London, University of Chicago Press, 2006
xiv + 271 pp., ISBN: 0-22633095-8 (£16.00)

Of all South Korea's traditional musical forms, the percussion band genre, *p'ungmul*, is the one that is played by the most people. There are many institutions across the whole country that enable enthusiasts from all walks of life to participate in groups; particularly prevalent are music circles that operate in schools, universities and private performing arts centres, where experts provide classes for the general public. Given the genre's popularity, it is surprising that until now no book-length studies of the genre have been published in the English language, and relatively few in the Korean language. One reason for this paucity is that it was only quite recently, from around 1980, that *p'ungmul* experienced its revival, the dying *p'ungmul* traditions of rural communities being taken up by younger urban generations as a means of expressing Korean identity and building group solidarity.

Nathan Hesselink's book does much to fill the gap in English language scholarship. It examines many facets of the *p'ungmul* music-making world, including typical contexts for skill acquisition and performance, musical instruments, regional stylistic traits and repertoires. At the same time, it discusses what the genre has come to represent for urban performers and the general public. Throughout the book's six chapters, Hesselink skilfully interweaves his examination of these two strains – what he terms the "logos" and "mythos" (borrowing from Armstrong and Jung) – to create a well-rounded picture.

The book is both highly informative and a pleasure to read. Not only does Hesselink write with clarity, avoiding unnecessary jargon and wordiness, he also employs a highly effective method of presenting material, embedding many of his main sources in the work itself to create what he calls a "collage". Thus, his own analysis, which incorporates many excellent tables, is interspersed with numerous translated excerpts from interviews and other scholars' publications. Although these sections are sometimes long and only lightly edited, they are in most cases very well chosen. By enabling those involved in *p'ungmul* to speak for themselves, Hesselink avoids overly imposing his own interpretations on material.

In the first chapter, entitled "Assets and contexts", Hesselink provides a brief introduction to the Cultural Asset system. This is an appropriate starting point; it is hard to overestimate the influence of this system in shaping traditional music making in South Korea. Hesselink then presents a number of lengthy extracts from a field report made by the Cultural Asset Research Institute in 1982, documenting *p'ungmul* activities in North Chŏlla province – an area particularly rich in traditional folk music-making. The extracts not only reveal at first hand the Cultural Asset system's approach to documentation, but also show the diversity of performance contexts that existed at that time. Hesselink then introduces us to his musical mentors, Kim Hyŏngsun and Yi Sangbaek, both specialists in *p'ungmul* styles from North Chŏlla

province; Kim is a member of the government appointed Cultural Asset troupe, Iri Nongak, and Yi is a leading light in the Puan county style. Hesselink provides lengthy transcriptions of Kim and Yi reminiscing in colourful detail about their lives in *p'ungmul*.

In the second chapter, "Historical traces", Hesselink explores the cultural roots of *p'ungmul* through meticulously detailing all the material elements of the typical performance: the musical instruments, costumes and paraphernalia, the ground formations delineated by performers and the various role-playing actors. He shows that the genre is a "broad cultural repository", incorporating elements from a wide variety of sources, including shamanic, Buddhist and neo-Confucian ritual, and military drill.

In the third chapter, "By and for 'the people'", Hesselink investigates one of *p'ungmul*'s most conspicuous sociological functions – that of binding the group together. He begins by introducing the concept of the masses, *minjung* – pervasive ever since the late 19th-century *tonghak* (Eastern learning) movement – and then presents translations of large chunks from texts by O Chŏngsŏp and Kim Inu. These works are undoubtedly among the most articulate expressions of the *minjung* theory interpretation of *p'ungmul* performance – typical of the 1980s and 1990s and still prevalent today.

In the fourth chapter, "Transmitted by mouth, taken in by heart", Hesselink describes the learning experiences and social interactions that he encountered in the teaching institutions of his mentors Kim and Yi – respectively an enormous centre based in Chŏnju and specializing in the "right side" (*udo*) style of *p'ungmul* (originating from the Western part of North Chŏlla Province) and a small university student circle specializing in the "left side" (*chwado*) style (from the Eastern part of the province). Hesselink points out that these institutions favoured contrasting teaching strategies, the former emphasizing communal learning and using a less structured pedagogical style and the latter involving more focus on the individual and a more class-room like approach. Both institutions, however, encouraged the same build up of skills from simplified patterns, through "performance interpretations", to an extensive repertoire of rhythmic variations. Hesselink subtly integrates analysis of instrumental playing techniques and clarifies the differences between the "left" and "right" styles of North Chŏlla Province *p'ungmul*, also detailing the continuing rivalry between the two.

In the fifth chapter, "The repertoire", Hesselink continues to focus on the two North Chŏlla *p'ungmul* styles expounded by his mentors, detailing the standardized compositional make-up of their respective *p'an kut* (entertainment-oriented performance), this being the only performance context that these groups are involved in. He guides us through the two lengthy sequences of rhythmic patterns, meticulously detailing tempi, defining features of performance, the meanings of names and large-scale internal rhythmic subdivisions (via numerical formulae such as 2+2+2+2). Although the detail is impressive, the reader unavoidably mourns the absence of audio-visual illustration (ideally a supplementary DVD). Although

Hesselink does refer the reader to a website in which the sequences of patterns are transcribed in Korean box notation, this seems far from ideal; this notation system is not readily legible by the uninitiated and, as Hesselink acknowledges, the *p'ungmul* performance involves a complex interplay of many elements, both visual and audible.

The book closes with a brief sixth chapter, "Timely reflections", in which Hesselink returns to the notions of "logos" and "mythos", summing up *p'ungmul*'s place in contemporary life via poignant quotes from his mentors and other members of their groups.

Overall, Hesselink's book constitutes an informative investigation into the lives and practices of *p'ungmul* musicians. The abundance of well-selected extracts from primary sources – in particular, the interviews with Kim and Yi – provides penetrating insights into the worldviews of practitioners. Hopefully there will be further English language studies of *p'ungmul*, of a similar depth and sensitivity to Hesselink's. There is indeed much work to be done; Hesselink's book is far from comprehensive, focusing almost exclusively on the practices of just two groups from a small area of a single province and documenting in detail only the most widespread urban practices. Certainly at the time of Hesselink's research (the mid-1990s) some *p'ungmul* groups continued to perform traditional functions barely touched upon in the book, such as *kŏllip kut* (for collecting funds and giving blessings). More significantly, at that time a small number of rural village groups still persisted, for whom the genre remained intimately tied to village life and ritual. (This reviewer encountered such groups in North and South Kyŏngsang provinces in 2000.) However, these points are by no means offered here as negative criticism of Hesselink's excellent work; to cover so much in such depth within the space of a single volume is a rare feat indeed.

Simon Mills
*SOAS, University of London*
*simomills@hotmail.com*

**Songs, Dreamings, and Ghosts: The Wangga of North Australia**
Allan Marett
Middletown, CT, Wesleyan University Press, 2005
320 pp., with CD. ISBN: 0-81956618-7 ($34.95)

> Marett is awed by what he has seen. He communicates clearly his wonder and admiration for the Indigenous achievement without losing sight of the technical needs of the analysis. (AIATSIS 2006)

*Songs, Dreamings, and Ghosts* by Allan Marett is a triumph of musicological achievement and engagement with the endangered intellectual traditions of Indigenous Australia. Based on 20 years of work with remote Indigenous commu-

nities across northern Australia, Marett's book makes a timely contribution to understandings of Australian musics and Indigenous cultures. Its significance and integrity as a work of exemplary scholarship was recently recognized by the Australian Institute of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Studies (AIATSIS) with the Stanner Award for 2006. This award was founded in 1985 in memory of the anthropologist W. E. H. Stanner who once described the general lack of public awareness about Indigenous Australians as the "great Australian silence".

In *Songs, Dreamings, and Ghosts*, Marett explores the inner logic of a discrete tradition of song and dance called *wangga*. Concentrated in the Daly Region of Australia's Northern Territory among the neighbouring Marri-tjevin, Marri-ammu and Wadjiginy peoples, this tradition was one of many that once flourished in Australia before British colonization, but is now one of the few that remain current in isolated pockets across the continent's north, west and centre.

The book convincingly argues how songs and dances of the *wangga* tradition articulate broad cosmological, ontological, political and historical themes, and how performers work within the conventions of this tradition to configure social meaning. Understanding the agency of *wangga* composers and singers as leaders in their society is central to this process. Relations between the living and the sentient dead, the passage of law and knowledge from one generation to the next, the management of discrete lineages of inheritance and succession rights over country are each negotiated and, sometimes, contested through the composition and performance of *wangga* to the extent that subtle melodic variations can elicit explosions of anger from listeners and reignite past disagreements over hereditary rights to country.

Marett declares his deep awe for the amount of information that a single *wangga* song lasting less than one minute can convey. The work that he presents in *Songs, Dreamings, and Ghosts* is accordingly characterized by clear and engaging musical and choreographic analyses that meaningfully articulate relationships between the conventions of *wangga* and the maintenance of social order among its originating communities. While Marett espouses the essential centrality of musical transcription and analysis in exploring these relationships, he also takes great care to deploy these methods strategically in ways that help readers to identify the, often very brief, gestures in *wangga* performances that are of most significance.

Working through detailed discussions of the histories, ceremonial applications and stylistic conventions of the *wangga* tradition to analyses of four specific *wangga* repertoires from the Daly Region, Marett not only reveals the inner logic of *wangga* but also the personalities behind the tradition. Tommy Barrtjap, Billy Mandji, Bobby Lambudju Lane and Kenny Burrenjuck were among the *wangga* practitioners – many of whom have since passed away – who accepted Marett into their world and whose music his book analyses. Though they were little known and understood beyond the Indigenous communities of northern Australia, Marett's admiration for their achievements as leaders, artists and champions of Indigenous cultural survival shines through infectiously in all aspects of his work.

Based on 20 years of collaboration with Indigenous communities and *wangga* practitioners in northern Australia, the sources on which *Songs, Dreamings, and Ghosts* draw are highly original. The book brings together the large corpus of *wangga* recordings gathered by Marett and his colleagues in the field, and also considers those recorded earlier by A. P. Elkin and Alice Moyle. All original recordings gathered by Marett through this study remain available to their source communities from AIATSIS and from local sound archives that were established with his help. A sizeable sample of these recordings, the majority of which are unavailable elsewhere, is included with the book on an accompanying CD. They are critical in bringing the *wangga* tradition to life for readers and underscore the uniqueness of Marett's scholarship.

*Songs, Dreamings, and Ghosts* is the first book to offer a detailed account of any single performance tradition of Indigenous Australia. It is both compelling and essential reading for any scholar in (ethno)musicology or related disciplines, or in interdisciplinary fields such as Indigenous studies and Australian studies. As a study that radically advances research into Indigenous Australia performance traditions beyond the survey methods of earlier scholars, it can be highly recommended for use as a model musicological and ethnographic text in undergraduate coursework.

There has also been considerable interest in *Songs, Dreamings, and Ghosts* from beyond the academic arena and it is perhaps here that Marett's scholarship will make its greatest contributions. Unlike the work of Indigenous Australian visual artists, performance traditions such as *wangga* remain unseen and unheard by the vast majority. The Indigenous communities in which they remain current are among the most isolated and impoverished in Australia, and there is genuine concern among their practitioners that they may soon be lost entirely. *Songs, Dreamings, and Ghosts* explores the innate beauty and deep poetry of the *wangga* tradition with clarity, passion and intellectual integrity in way that contributes substantially to (ethno)musicology, Indigenous studies, Australian studies and related areas of research. It reminds us of what has been lost through the Great Australian Silence, and will be lost if practitioners of Indigenous Australian performance traditions such as *wangga* remain unknown and unsupported by the majority in their current bids for cultural survival.

## Reference

AIATSIS. 2006. Expert reader's report on *Songs, Dreamings, and Ghosts* (Marett 2005) for the 2006 Stanner Award. Canberra: Australian Institute of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Studies.

Aaron Corn
*The University of Sydney*
*aaron.corn@arts.usyd.edu.au*

**On a Rock in the Middle of the Ocean: Songs and Singers in Tory Island, Ireland**
Lillis Ó Laoire
Lanham, MD, Scarecrow Press, 2005
xvi + 359 pp., with CD, ISBN: 0-81085136-9 ($85.00)

Lillis Ó Laoire is both an academic specializing in Irish language and literature and a leading interpreter of traditional *sean-nós* ("old style") singing. He was brought up in the Donegal Gaeltacht (one of the Gaelic-speaking regions of the Republic of Ireland), in an area which faces Tory, an island lying nine miles out in the Atlantic Ocean. As with many of Ireland's other islands, Tory's population has fallen somewhat in recent years, and in the 1970s, after a period of particularly severe weather, a number of families applied to the local authority to be rehoused on the mainland. According to the 2002 census Tory Island's year-round population had dropped to 165 compared to some 400 residents in 1851. Nevertheless, music continues to be an essential part of community life, and cultural boundaries are apparent between the island and the mainland. Ó Laoire has been interacting with the people of Tory for more than 20 years as a musical participant in their activities as much as an observer of them.

Although he is a very fine singer, as his CD *Bláth Gach Géag dá dTig* amply demonstrates, Ó Laoire is modest about his ability as a musicologist. The current volume, a reworking in English of his Irish-language PhD thesis presented at University College Cork, "*Ar chreag i lár na farraige*": *próiseas an chultúir i leith sheachadadh agus láithriú na namhán i dToraigh* (1999), is thus an ethnographic study which places the act of performance into the foreground, and concerns itself with the reasons why the islanders sing and how meaning is constructed in the texts of their songs and in their dances as ritualized performance. Following the classification of cultural flow proposed by Hannerz, Ó Laoire focuses chiefly on the framework described as *form of life* which comprises "everyday activities . . . [which] coalesce into habitual enduring points of view" (p. 6). Threading through the book, and providing supporting evidence, is a series of transcriptions and analyses of formal interviews held with three of Tory's senior musicians (two male and one female), who were born in the 1920s or 1930s.

Ó Laoire's theoretical approach is informed by the hermeneutics of Hans-Georg Gadamer and Paul Ricoeur. From Gadamer's philosophy he takes the importance of the hermeneut's recognition of his or her own prejudices within a tradition and the observation that "understanding" is subjective – it is "an act of participation in a tradition" (p. 29). In Ricoeur's theory of mimesis Ó Laoire finds a means of interpreting song and dance on Tory Island as "*fictions*, in Ricoeur's specialized sense of the term, as new creations which reveal a world beyond ostensive, everyday reality" (p. 33). The social behaviour of the Tory community is thus presented as a text to be interpreted in subsequent chapters.

In chapter 3, Ó Laoire suggests that, in terms of the acquisition of culture on Tory Island, a distinction can be drawn between the expressions used by participants for

the orally mediated process of "lifting" (*tógáil* in Irish) and "learning" (*foghlaim*) in which the written text generally acts as intermediary. He then moves on in the following chapter to introduce the concepts of *ceart* (indicating rightness or correctness) and *ciotach* (incorrectness) which are applied by musicians and audiences to the *cuma* (the shape, form or appearance) of a performance.

This sets up the theoretical stall in chapter 5 for an investigation of the performance of song in Tory that draws on Gadamer's theory of play. Ó Laoire links participants' metaphorical usage of the psycho-physiological terms *teas* (heat) and *fuacht* (cold) to the positive attribute of *cumha* (a feeling of longing or pining) and the negative *uaigneas* (loneliness or supernatural fear) and in the next chapter further explores these relationships through a discussion of his own personal experiences of dances on Tory. He argues that these four concepts "form primary components of the emotional framework of the Tory Island community, part of their historically constituted self-understanding, in that islanders regard them as a natural part of their worldview, so much so, in fact, that they are taken for granted" (p. 179).

Empirical evidence for this view is provided in the subsequent chapter, a detailed textual analysis and interpretative case study of the song "*A Phaidí A Ghra*" (Paddy my dear), the words of which have a particular importance for one specific Tory family, and more generally for many of the islanders. Although Ó Laoire provides a transcription by Sandra Joyce of a performance of the song recorded on Tory in 1956, and he does offer some musical detail, he concentrates on the construction of the meaning of the text (in the broadest sense) within its performance context. A further pair of chapters considers the relationships between performance and emotion – sorrow and joy, *caoines* and bawdy verses – and the transformation through song of real life into a fictional narrative, again drawing on theoretical perspectives from Gadamer and Ricoeur.

Overall this is an important and valuable publication for the student of Irish traditional culture, both as an ethnography of performance practice within a relatively isolated Irish-speaking community for which traditional music remains an important marker of identity and as a hermeneutic study of the texts and contexts of traditional song and dance. The musicologist may possibly be a little disappointed by the relative lack of detailed musical analysis in the discussion (though the accompanying CD contains some wonderful examples of music recorded on Tory Island between 1950 and 1989 on its 26 tracks), but there is much to compensate for this. It is a work of considerable authority, perceptively written by a scholar and musician who has had a particularly close and enduring personal relationship with his subject, but it is also one in which his humility, integrity and humanity shine through.

David Cooper
*University of Leeds*
*D.G.Cooper@leeds.ac.uk*

**Bartók, Hungary, and the Renewal of Tradition: Case Studies in the Intersection of Modernity and Nationality**

David E. Schneider
Berkeley, CA, University of California Press, 2006
308 pp., ISBN: 0-520-24503-2 (£32-50)

This beautifully produced book is the first extensive English language study examining the influence of 19th-century Hungarian art music on Béla Bartók's compositions. Indeed, some of the author's suggestions – for example, about Bartók's compositional connection to the 19th-century Hungarian composer Ferenc Erkel – seem to be groundbreaking within Bartók literature.

One of David Schneider's main themes is that, although Bartók himself used the compositional tools (such as based on the traditional *verbunkos*) of 19th-century Hungarian art music, he campaigned against the genre in favour of Hungarian compositions based on pure Hungarian folk music. Schneider argues that the *verbunkos* and its vocal counterpart are not as far from Hungarian folk music as Bartók claimed. Yet, despite Schneider's argument and the *verbunkos*' association with Hungarian traditional music, the *verbunkos* most probably originates from composed art music, even if rural communities adopted such compositions, thus blurring the division between folk and art music. Furthermore, the *verbunkos* contains ingredients from many nations. Bence Szabolcsi, arguably the father of 20th-century Hungarian musicology, determines that:

> [a]round 1760 the verbunkos appeared as the characteristic accompaniment of the recruiting ceremony. The verbunkos sources, not yet completely known, include some of the traditions of the old Hungarian popular music (Heyduck dance, swineherd dance), certain Levantine, Balkan and Slav elements, probably through the intermediation of the Gypsies, and also elements of the Viennese-Italian music, coming, no doubt, from the first cultivators of the verbunkos, the urban musicians of German culture. (Szabolcsi 1964, 54)

Indeed, the Hungarian word *verbunkos* derives from the German word *Werbung*. More importantly for Bartók, genuine folk music of any nation had to originate in peasant communities, therefore the *verbunkos* and its vocal counter-part could not be regarded as Hungarian folk music.

As Schneider amply and ably demonstrates, Bartók used *verbunkos* elements at all stages in his compositional life. Schneider's detailed examples deal with early Bartók compositions (such as *Kossuth* from 1903) as well as with mature late compositions (the Violin Concerto from 1938). In the process, Schneider examines 19th-century Hungarian art music in painstaking detail. We learn of similar compositional tools used by 19th-century Hungarian composers as well as by Bartók.

Though Schneider clearly studied a great many sources, he has omitted to notice at least two important contributions to the field which he is tackling in his otherwise carefully researched book. In 1955 Zoltán Kodály gave a lecture, "From Szentirmay to

Bartók", with music examples, which was published (though without Kodály's audio examples) the same year. In this short but significant paper Kodály shows how the song "*Utca, utca*" – composed with traditional *verbunkos* elements by the 19th-century composer Elemér Szentirmay – influenced many Bartók compositions. From the *verbunkos* elements Kodály points to the repetition of intervallic thirds and to the use of tritons and augmented seconds. He mentions that Bartók later met such occurrences in folk music but that the initial encounter was provided by Szentirmay's composition. Kodály's music examples at the lecture included – among other Bartók compositions – sections from the 2nd String Quartet and from the *Dance Suite*. The other crucial, and more extensive, contribution to the field that Schneider overlooks is Ferenc Bónis' study "*Bartók und der Verbunkos*" (1971). Bónis shows how *verbunkos* elements were embedded in great many Bartók compositions from early works right up to the 3rd Piano Concerto.

Five of Schneider's six chapters deal with the main theme: "Tradition rejected: Bartók's polemics and the nineteenth-century Hungarian musical inheritance"; "Tradition maintained: nationalism, verbunkos, Kossuth and the Rhapsody, Op.1"; "Tradition transformed: 'The Night's Music' and the pastoral roots of a modern style"; "Tradition transcribed: the Rhapsody for Violin No.1, the politics of folk-music research and the artifice of authenticity"; "Tradition restored: the Violin Concerto, verbunkos, and Hungary on the eve of World War II". In each chapter Schneider provides an enormous amount of information. He tackles his arguments from historical as well as from analytical points of view. Arguably, he leaves no stone unturned.

The remaining chapter – the fourth in the book, "Tradition challenged: confronting Stravinsky" – is a very informative and interesting study on Stravinsky's influence on Bartók. The content and arguments of the chapter are very impressive but the inclusion of the topic raises questions. Stravinsky was indeed a significant influence – ironically mostly because of his use of folklore, which Stravinsky eventually rejected – but so was Richard Strauss. As Schneider's extensive Stravinsky chapter hardly touches on folklore elements, one could argue that, in order to present a fuller picture, the Stravinsky influence should have been complemented with a Richard Strauss chapter. On the other hand, the Stravinsky chapter is so fascinating that on balance its inclusion is worthwhile.

Throughout his book, Schneider provides an enormous amount of information about Hungarian history, important Hungarian musicologists and music critics. Schneider's music examples are generous, his music analyses are long and painstaking. Indeed, the richness of the book may also be its negative side. In order to be fully engaged, the reader needs to be interested in general history, music history and music analysis.

The title of the book may be misunderstood by the unsuspecting reader. As seen above, "the renewal of tradition" in the title refers to Bartók's use of traditional Hungarian compositional tools. However, I am pleased to report that there is indeed

a renewal of tradition (of folk songs and folk dances) in present-day Hungary. But that may be another book some other time.

## References

Szabolcsi, Bence. 1964. *A concise history of Hungarian music*. Budapest.
Kodály, Zoltán. 1955. *Szentirmaytól Bartókig*. Budapest: Új Zenei Szemle, pp. 6–9.
Bónis, Ferenc. 1971. *"Bartók und der Verbunkos"*. International Musicological Conference in Commemoration of Béla Bartók, pp. 145–52.

Agnes Kory
*Bela Bartok Centre for Musicianship*
*agnes.kory@kcl.ac.uk*

## Musical Childhoods and the Cultures of Youth

Susan Boynton and Roe-Min Kok (eds)
Middleton, CT, Wesleyan University Press, 2006
272 pp., ISBN: 0-8195-6803-1 (£17.50)

This thought-provoking book contains ten essays which provide a wealth of material on the role of music in childhood studies and youth cultures. This interdisciplinary endeavour – drawing upon humanities, social sciences and historical studies – is a welcome contribution to an area defined by Bruno Nettl as a "minority" (1983, 342) in ethnomusicological and anthropological enquiry (see also Hirschfield 2002). In the preface, Susan Boynton and Roe-Min Kok introduce three themes – ritual performance, identity formation and musical socialization – that provide a framework to examine the participation of children and young people in music, adult reflections of childhood learning and musical experience, and ethnographic studies of children's musical cultures (p. ix).

The first three essays focus upon ritual performance. In chapter 1, examining the sociomusical role of child oblates in the abbey of Cluny in France, Susan Boynton and Isabelle Cochelin reassess notions of childhood during the 11th century, taking issue with Ariès' (1962) claim that childhood did not exist in medieval society. Boynton and Cochelin detail the children's everyday life and musical training in the abbey where, despite their lowly position within the hierarchy, young boys played an integral role in ritual and musical performances.

In chapter 2 Todd M. Borgerding explores the prominent part played by choirboys during Corpus Christi in 16th-century Spain, where they sang, danced and acted the roles of prophets and angels in public processions. Both these essays provide new understanding of the role of children in the church where their "bodies and voices functioned to deliver doctrinal messages while at the same time representing the invisible" (p. 38).

Anne Dhu McLucas, in chapter 3, examines the role of silence adopted by girls during coming-of-age Mescalero Apache initiation ceremonies in New Mexico, USA. Through vivid descriptions, where the hush of an initiate is contrasted with the sounds produced by the jingles on her ceremonial dress, McLucas (p. 60) explains that Mescalero women, in contrast to their prominent everyday decision-making role, consider silence to be a powerful attribute during times when their identity is in flux. Therefore, by remaining silent during this rite of passage, girls observe both an "important and [a] paradoxical fact" (p. 50).

The following four chapters focus upon processes through which musical identities are formulated while considering also the influence of institutions upon children and young people. Steven Huebner undertakes both a Freudian and a Piagetian analysis of Ravel and Colette's *L'Enfant et les sortilèges*. By examining attitudes to child rearing and the impact this has on the "making" of the identity of the *L'enfant*, Huebner explores "child development theories as narrative constructs, on the premise that these are transposable to many different times, places, and social classes" (p. 73).

In the fifth chapter, Roe-Min Kok reflects upon her experiences of learning piano via the British-based ABRSM examinations while growing up in an ethnic community in Malaysia. Through engaging autobiography coupled with postcolonial theory, Kok explores issues surrounding the transmission of Western music in a Non-Western context. For the author this process consistently destabilized her identity in "the encounter between a cultural system perceived as established and hegemonic (European via the British) and one of struggling to define itself (Malaysian-minority Chinese)" (p. 97).

In chapter 6, Patricia Tang investigates how adult male Wolof griot musicians in Senegal increasingly rely upon their childhood musical experiences memories not only to authenticate their position to Western researchers, but also to construct and reinforce their identities in a modern Senegal (p. 107). It is evident from Tang's analysis of interview material with griot musicians that childhood plays a central role in their training. However, as Tang states, "it is the fact that adult griots choose to emphasise this part of their past while telling their life histories to Western researchers that shows the importance of childhood in constructing identity" (p. 118).

In chapter7, by exploring the childhood and adolescent memories of three female *p'ansori* singers, Heather Willoughby examines Korean women's attempts to balance traditional music and notions of traditional life with their own personal musical identities. Although not easy in a country where Confucian mores still prevail, Willoughby writes that a similar difficulty is faced by Korean youth who "must strike a balance between accepting and rejecting highly respected but insular traditions and currents in contemporary globalization" (p. 138).

The final three chapters focus upon musical socialization, in particular, the ways in which musical traditions are transformed, appropriated and repositioned and the impact this has upon the musical experiences of children and young people. Joy H. Calico examines the creation of new German folk songs to promote a "new" identity to East German children and youth following the Second World War. Supported by

Hobsbawm's (1992 [1982]) famous insight about the "invention of tradition", Calico investigates how adults developed an education policy for children where newly composed folk songs were intended to have "an indelible lifelong impression on young citizens" (p. 163). Originally written to promote socialist and antifascist sentiments, today such songs tend to trigger nostalgic memories among adult informants. Calico states such emotional responses "indicate that the role of song in the evocation of nostalgia is very powerful" (p. 163).

Adult nostalgia for childhood is also an important theme in chapter 9 where Hermann Gottschewski and Machiko Gottschewski investigate the late 19th-century Japanese appropriation of Western classical music and the establishment of a new music culture for children. New songs – using Western tones and scales – were introduced into schools to form a centralized and restricted repertoire. However, traditionalists considered these new songs to be too colloquial since, for the most part, they were written by school teachers and not poets. To counter this influence, indigenous nursery rhymes (*Warabe-uta*) were reintroduced to children as a new "foreign" music in order to create a romantic image of Japanese childhood (p. 181).

Juxtaposed with an essay concerning music for young children, the final chapter is concerned with the music of youth. Judah M. Cohen investigates songleading – the practice of leading liturgical and paraliturgical Jewish singing – among Jewish Reform teenagers. Cohen describes songleading as "a phenomenon both propagated and mediated by young people" which "creates and serves as a value system for entrance into the adult world" (p. 188). As an activity where young people are the primary "practitioners and purveyors" (p. 189) of this particular musical tradition, the practice of songleading is fundamental to creating notions of community among young people. As a result, Cohen appeals to scholars to further investigate "youth expression as youth expression" (p. 191) and to place youth music in a more "deeply qualitative context", a process which may help to surpass "the artificial (perhaps culturally imposed) boundaries of the childhood/adult dichotomy" (p. 192).

In the afterword, Amanda Minks reiterates a previous observation (see Minks 2002), stating that there has been "no clear line of line of development in musical research on childhood" (p. 217). For Minks, this lack of clarity is due to a focus on "bounded systems of socialisation and enculturation" (p. 217) by anthropologists and ethnomusicologists concerning child and youth studies. Such research has "largely obscured global political-economic patterns" (p. 217) that have affected children, young people and their musical cultures. Is Minks correct, and is this a possible reason why studies of children's music and the musical cultures of youth remain a "minority" area of scholarly research? Although this volume does not aim to answer this weighty question it is a most valuable contribution to childhood and youth music studies. It demonstrates why the musical cultures of children and young people should no longer be positioned on the ethnomusicological periphery.

## References

Ariès, Phillippe. 1962. *Centuries of childhood*, translated by Robert Baldick. New York: Vintage Books

Lawrence Hirschfeld, Why don't anthropologists like children?, American Anthropologist 104 (2) (2002) 611–27.

Hobsbawm, Eric. 1992 [1983]. Introduction: Inventing traditions. In *The Invention of Tradition*, edited by E. Hobsbawm and T. Ranger. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp. 1–14.

Amanda Minks, From children's songs to expressive practices: Old and new directions in the ethnomusicological study of children, Ethnomusicology 46 (3) (2002) 379–408.

Bruno Nettl, The study of ethnomusicology: Twenty-nine issues and concepts, University of Illinois Press, Urbana and Chicago, IL, 1983.

Jonathan McIntosh
*The University of Western Australia*
*jonathan.mcintosh@uwa.edu.au*

## ***Falak*: The Voice of Destiny: Traditional, Popular and Symphonic Music of Tajikistan**

Compiled by Federico Spinetti
Two CDs with 19-page booklet by Federico Spinetti
Topic Records, TSCD932D, 2006

The music of Tajikistan has received surprisingly little attention. This may reflect in part the geographical inaccessibility of this former soviet republic and in part the political instability that attended its independence in 1991, both conditions making ethnomusicological research there difficult. While a number of scholars have conducted fieldwork in different parts of the country, they have tended to focus upon the expressive culture of minority groups, the *shashmaqom* tradition among Uzbeks in the northern province of Khujand and the *madoh* tradition among Pamiris in the south-eastern province of Badakhshan being featured in the scholarly literature. Spinetti has sought to redress this imbalance, conducting research (2002–4) among musicians in the southern province of Kulob, recording a wide variety of styles characteristic of different contexts. In this recording, he presents an excellent overview of musical genres from the region, taking care to embrace both urban and rural styles and to include both traditional and contemporary forms. Consisting of two compact discs and accompanied by an extended commentary, *Falak: The Voice of Destiny* represents an important addition to the extant archival sources on Tajik music, Topic Records (as part of its World Series) providing an established label for the publication of this important collection.

The publication is divided into two parts. In part one, Spinetti provides an overview of traditional genres that he (for the most part) recorded during field research, focusing in particular upon *falak*, a musical style typically associated with the acknowledgement of destiny and the expression of sorrow. Providing distinctive

solo performances of *falak* drawn from different parts of Takjikistan, he explores the various manifestations of the genre in instrumental music, showing how *falak* has come to express particular regional identities and individual ideological positions, the formation of a specially designated state ensemble being politically significant. Here he documents the ways in which *falak* has become conflated with other regional styles, sometimes being part of a medley of vocal genres (such as *ghazals*) or sometimes being featured as a non-metric improvisation in a selection of instrumental pieces. While not expanded upon in this publication (see Spinetti 2005, 152–65), his study of *falaki zina ba zina* (English, "falak step-by-step") is of especial interest, the melodic material framing a classical text gradually ascending to a climactic moment (*avj*) in imitation of *shashmaqom*. Here the intersection between the traditional and the classical is significant, a southern genre vying for national recognition in a tightly contested cultural space.

In part two, Spinetti presents a selection of contemporary compositions, for the most part numbers reissued from local commercial labels or from state archival sources. While some of these recordings feature contemporary performances of *falak*, the section is principally devoted to the presentation of popular genres that are performed by different groups (usually of Kulobi extraction) for social events in both rural and urban contexts. This selection also features a number of musicians who perform both traditional and popular styles, invoking an eclectic range of musical influences for commercial effect. In this, they meld local performance practice with a global sound aesthetic, the influence of America, India, Iran and Russia being especially apparent. However, Spinetti does not include here a representative selection of Iranian (such as Moein) or Turkish (such as Tarkan) singers, artists who are extremely prominent in the Tajik media, their sonic imprint resounding in the urban soundscape. The collection ends with three symphonic compositions, orchestral adaptations of traditional pieces tailored originally to suit a soviet sensibility but now employed to advocate a national sentiment. In this respect, the rousing performance of *Respublikai Man* (English, "My republic") by the opera singer Rustam Duloev is particularly memorable.

Yet Spinetti seems to complete two separate tasks in this publication. On the one hand, he provides a convincing overview of *falak* musical styles; on the other hand, he presents an interesting coverage of contemporary musical aesthetics. The result is a certain degree of disjointedness, unrelated musical genres being juxtaposed and related musical styles being separated. The problem is especially apparent in the otherwise exemplary text, individual numbers being detailed with reference to specific performers, sometimes leading to repetition and confusion. Perhaps, Spinetti should have focused exclusively upon *falak*, presenting greater information on performance practices and cultural contexts, providing musical transcriptions and song texts where relevant. In particular, he could have supplied more linguistic information, discussing in greater detail the poetic genres used and the poetic themes employed. Further, he might have explored the folklore surrounding *falak*, looking, for instance, at the ways in which the genre connects man and nature in some

traditions. That being said, Spinetti is bound by the constraints of Topic Records, publishing here a high-quality collection relevant to the specialist and accessible to the non-specialist. In this respect, *Falak: The Voice of Destiny* is a significant publication, extending considerably the scholarly understanding of music in Tajikstan.

John Morgan O'Connell
*Cardiff University*
*oconnelljm@Cardiff.ac.uk*

## Reference

Spinetti, Federico. 2005. Music, politics and identity in post-soviet Tajikistan. PhD dissertation, School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London.